## **POLICY 3.31**

**5-D** I recommend the Board approve the proposed revisions to Policy 3.31, entitled "Grievance Procedure for Employees."

[Contacts: Dr. Mary Ann DuPont, 434-8963; or Dr. Bernard Shulman, 434-8500]

### Development

- The DOE's Educational Equity Monitoring Work Plan requested that this Policy allow 60 days for initial reporting of alleged discrimination or harassment, reflecting the recent recommendations of the federal Office for Civil Rights.
- The new Section (4) is based on the employee-related portions of Policies 5.001 and 5.81 and provides a procedure tailored to resolving discrimination and harassment complaints, including the requested 60-day limit.
- Retaliation is prohibited at line 345.
- Based on the Board's recent discussion about procedures for investigation of its direct reports (the Superintendent, the Chief Counsel, and the District Auditor), Section (7) has been expanded to cover grievances by or about such direct reports or the employees they supervise. Paragraph (7)(c) is based on discussions with school board attorneys in three other large districts.

CONSENT ITEM

# **PROPOSED REVISIONS TO POLICY 3.31**

#### **GRIEVANCE PROCEDURE FOR EMPLOYEES**

1			GRIEVANCE PROCEDURE FOR EMPLOYEES
2 3 4 5 6 7	<u>1.</u>	miss Dire	DEFINITIONS Purpose The purpose of this procedure is to secure, at the est administrative level, equitable solutions to claim(s) arising from a violation, application, or misinterpretation of School Board Policies or Administrative ectives, which may include harassment prohibited by Policy 3.19, and to ablish an orderly succession of procedures wherein these solutions may be sued.
8 9	<u>2.</u>		PURPOSED Definitions As used herein, the following terms have these anings:
10 11 12 13 14		equ misi gua	purpose of this procedure is to secure, at the lowest administrative level, itable solutions to claim(s) arising from a violation, misapplication, or interpretation of School Board Policies and Administrative Directives and to rantee an orderly succession of procedures wherein these solutions may be sued.
15 16 17		a.	A <u>"grievance"</u> is a complaint which alleges a violation, misinterpretation, or misapplication of School Board Policy or Administrative Directives, including <u>discrimination or harassment prohibited by Policy 3.19</u> .
18 19		b.	The term "employee" includes every employee, instructional or non-instructional, of the School Board of Palm Beach County.
20 21 22		<u>C.</u>	The terms "grievant" and "complainant" refer to an employee (including an applicant as defined in Section (2)(e)) who alleges that he/she has been subjected to discrimination or harassment as prohibited by Policy 3.19.
23 24 25		<u>d.</u>	"Accused/employee" refers to an employee who is alleged to have subjected another employee to discrimination or harassment as prohibited by Policy 3.19.
26 27		<u>e.</u>	The term "applicant," as used herein, means a current District employee who applies for another instructional or non-instructional position within the District.

f. The term "days" in this procedure shall mean work days.

28

29 30 31 32 33 34 35		<u>g.</u>	The term "supervisor" means the Pprincipal, Ddirector, Aarea Executive Director superintendent, Assistant Superintendent, Deputy Superintendent, Superintendent of Schools or other Ddepartment Aadministrator who has the direct responsibility of supervising or managing the aggrieved employee and who has the authority to take action necessary to resolve the grievance. For purposes of this Policy, this term may also include a consultant retained by the Board to provide interim management assistance.			
36 37		<u>h.</u>	The term "superior" as used herein refers to the supervisor of the aggrieved employee's immediate supervisor.			
38		<u>i.</u>	A "chief officer" is the Chief Academic Officer or the Chief Operating Officer.			
39 40		<u>j.                                    </u>	The term "days" in this Policy shall mean work days unless calendar days are specified.			
41 42 43 44 45	3.	Dise is based 3.19	Procedure for Grievances (Other than Alleged Harassment or crimination) The following grievance procedure applies when the grievance ased on an allegation other than discrimination or harassment under Policy 9. (If the grievance is based on allegations of discrimination or harassment as hibited by Policy 3.19, the procedures of Section (4) shall apply, instead.)			
46		a.	Level One: Informal Conference			
47 48 49 50			Within ten (10) $\underline{\text{work}}$ days after the employee first knows or reasonably should have known, of the grievable incident, the employee shall initially discuss the matter with the immediate supervisor with the objective of informally resolving the matter.			
51 52 53			A. For an allegation of discrimination by one's supervisor, an employee may refer a complaint to the District's Equal Employment Opportunity (EEO) office in the Division of Personnel Services.			
54		b.	Level Two: Filing a Written Grievance			
55 56 57 58 59			<u>i.</u> Within ten (10) <u>work</u> days after the informal conference <u>described in Level One</u> , if no satisfactory disposition is made, the employee may file a written grievance with the supervisor. The written grievance shall set forth specifically the event(s) upon which the grievance is based, citing the Policy and/or Directive alleged to be violated, the date the alleged			

infraction took place, and grounds upon which the grievance is made.
The employee must sign and date the grievance.

 ii. Within ten (10) <u>work</u> days after receiving the written grievance, the supervisor shall schedule another meeting with the employee. Within ten (10) <u>work</u> days of the second meeting, <u>and after investigating the allegations</u>, the supervisor shall issue a written decision to the employee.

## c. Level Three: Review by the Supervisor's Superior or Chief Officer

- i. Within ten (10) work days after the supervisor's decision, if the employee is not satisfied with the supervisor's decision or if no decision has been made issued, the employee may forward the grievance and the supervisor's decision to the supervisor's superior or to the applicable chief officer department of Employee relations. The written grievance shall set forth the event(s) upon which the grievance is based. If the grievance is not forwarded to the superior or chief officer within the designated time, the grievance is considered withdrawn from the grievance process and shall be so noted in the grievance file.
- ii. Within ten (10) work days after receiving the grievance, the superior or chief officer Department of Employee relations will schedule a meeting with the employee. Within ten (10) work days of the said that meeting, meeting, and after further investigating the allegations as appropriate, the superior or chief officer Department of Employee Relations shall issue a written decision to the employee. A copy shall be provided to the supervisor.

#### d. Level Four: Appeal to the Superintendent

i. Within ten (10) work days after the superior or chief officer Department of Employee issues it's a written decision, if the employee is not satisfied with the decision (or if no decision is has been issued within ten (10) work days of the meeting), the employee may appeal the decision, in writing, to the Superintendent, or to the decision of the Department of Employee Relations.—If the grievant does not pursue the grievance past Level three, the grievant is encouraged to forward written correspondence to the Department of Employee Relations indicating that he/she is withdrawing the grievance from the grievance process. If the grievance is not forwarded to the Superintendent within the designated time, the

94		grievance is considered withdrawn from the grievance process and shall
95		be so noted in the grievance file.
96	ii.	The Superintendent <u>/ or</u> designee, shall appoint a <u>n ad hoc</u> Ggrievance
97		Rreview Ccommittee. The chair of the committee will be the highest-
98		ranking District official on the committee. The committee will consisting of
99		A. one (1) member from <u>District</u> management, selected by the
100		Superintendent-:
101		B. one (1) member selected by the grievant; and
102		C. the <u>a</u> third member selected by <u>agreement of</u> the <u>first</u> two (2)
103		members. If the third member is not selected by the other committee
104		members within seven (7) calendar days, the
105		Superintendent <u>/designee</u> , shall appoint a third member to serve on
106		the committee.
107	iii.	The highest ranking official in the District among the three (3) committee
108		members shall be the Ccommittee Cchairperson. In an effort to resolve
109		the grievance, Wwithin ten (10) work days after the Ccommittee is
110		designated, the <u>Cc</u> ommittee shall meet with the grievant and the
111		supervisor or superior of the person alleged to have violated,
112		misinterpreted, or misapplied a Policy or Directive. in an effort to resolve
113		the grievance. Other persons may be presented as witnesses at the
114		meeting by either the grievant or the supervisor <u>/superior</u> . The <u>committee</u>
115		shall issue a written decision recommendation within five (5) ten (10) work
116		days after the meeting, determining whether any violation has occurred,
117		and if so, an appropriate remedy. A copy of the <del>decision</del>
118		<u>recommendation</u> shall be provided to the grievant, supervisor <u>or superior</u> ,
119		the Director of Employee Labor Relations, and the Superintendent.
120	iv.	The decision of the Committee shall be final and binding. The
121		recommendation of the committee shall be forwarded to the
122		Superintendent for review. The Superintendent/designee shall review the
123		recommendation of the committee and the record of the grievance. If the
124		Superintendent/ designee finds that a meeting with the grievant would
125		assist in the final determination, the Superintendent/ designee may
126		schedule a meeting for the purposes of this review. The
127		Superintendent/designee's decision is the final and binding decision of

128			the District.
129	<u>4.</u>		ing and Resolving Allegations of Harassment or Discrimination
130		When the	ne cause for the grievance is an allegation of discrimination or harassment
131		<u>of an er</u>	nployee (including an applicant, as defined in Section (2)(e)), the following
132		procedu	ures shall apply:
133		a. Le	vel One: Reporting to the Supervisor or EEO Coordinator and
134		<u>Inv</u>	restigation by the EEO Coordinator/Designee
135			
136		<u>i.    </u>	Reporting Discrimination or Harassment Any employee (including
137			an applicant as defined in Section (2)(e)) who believes he/she is a victim
138			of discrimination or harassment as prohibited by Policy 3.19, may report
139			the incident(s) in writing to the principal or other immediate supervisor, as
140			applicable. Due to the sensitive nature of sexual harassment complaints,
141			or in the event of an allegation of harassment or discrimination by one's
142			supervisor, the complaint may be filed in writing directly with the District's
143			Equal Employment Opportunity Coordinator ("EEO Coordinator"). The
144			EEO Coordinator is located at: 3370 Forest Hill Boulevard, Suite A-115,
145			West Palm Beach, Florida, 33406; Telephone: (561) 434-8637.
146			
147		<u>ii.</u>	Complaints should be filed as soon as possible after the alleged incident,
148			but must be filed within sixty (60) calendar days after the employee
149			(including an applicant as defined in Section (2)(e)) first knows or should
150			have known of the grievable incident. Failure on the part of the
151			complainant to initiate and/or follow up on a complaint in a timely manner
152			may result in the complaint being deemed abandoned.
153			
154		<u>iii.</u>	The principal/designee or other immediate supervisor (as applicable) or
155			EEO Coordinator may assist the individual in putting the complaint in
156			writing, if its has not yet been recorded in writing; reviewing it with the
157			complainant; and obtaining the complainant's signature. The complainant
158			will be requested to provide signed, specific information regarding the
159			alleged discrimination or harassment, the alleged offender(s), witnesses,
160			and other relevant information. All complaints filed with the
161			principal/designee or other supervisor must be reported to the area
162			superintendent (if applicable) and the EEO Coordinator.
163			

104		iv. It is the responsibility of the principal, of other supervisor as applicable, to
165		forward all harassment or discrimination complaints to the area
166		superintendent (if applicable) and EEO Coordinator.
167		
168	b.	Investigation by EEO Coordinator The EEO Coordinator/designee shall
169		document and promptly and thoroughly investigate all complaints of
170		harassment or discrimination, including the following steps:
171		
172		i. promptly talk with the complainant. The complainant shall have an
173		opportunity to describe the incident, present any evidence, name
174		witnesses, and put his/her complaint in writing, if he/she has not already
175		done so;
176		
177		ii. talk with any witnesses or others who may have relevant information; and
178		•
179		iii. conduct an investigative meeting with the accused/employee, and the
180		accused/employee's representative, if applicable, to discuss the
181		allegations and allow the accused/employee to respond to the allegations
182		
183		iv. During the investigation, the EEO Coordinator may recommend to the
184		Chief Personnel Officer/designee any action deemed necessary to protect
185		the complainant or other employees, consistent with the requirements of
186		applicable laws.
187		
188		v. When necessary to carry out the investigation or for other good reasons,
189		and consistent with federal and state privacy laws, the EEO Coordinator
190		should discuss the complaint with any of the following persons, as
191		appropriate:
192		<del></del>
193		A. Superintendent/designee;
194		
195		B. chief officer:
196		<del>=</del>
197		C. area superintendent/designee :
198		
199		D. associate superintendents;
200		2. accounte caponinamiania,
201		E. Chief of School Police:

202					
203		F. Chief Personnel Officer:			
204					
205		G. Director of Labor Relations;			
206					
207		H. another employee whose knowledge of the persons involved may			
208		help determine the truth;			
209					
210		<ol> <li>legal counsel for the Board;</li> </ol>			
211					
212		J. the exclusive bargaining representative(s) or their legal counsel, if			
213		appropriate; and			
214					
215		K. the accused/employee.			
216					
217	<u>C.</u>	Decision of the EEO Coordinator Upon completion of the investigation, the			
218		EEO Coordinator/designee shall make a decision about the validity of the			
219		allegations in the complaint. The EEO Coordinator shall discuss the			
220		determination and any recommended corrective action with the			
221		principal/designee or other immediate supervisor, as applicable. In reaching a			
222		decision about the complaint, the following should be taken into account:			
223					
224		i. statements made by the persons identified above Section (4)(b):			
225					
226		ii. the details and consistency of each person's account:			
227					
228		iii. evidence of how the complainant reacted to the incident;			
229					
230		iv. evidence of past instances of harassment or discrimination by the			
231		accused/employee (provided that, if evidence of past harassment/			
232		discrimination is to be considered, the principal/designee must review in			
233		their entirety the files regarding those past incidents);			
234					
235		v. evidence of past harassment or discrimination complaints that were found			
236		to be untrue (provided that, if evidence of past accusations or complaints			
237		is to be considered, the principal/designee/supervisor must review in their			
238		entirety the files regarding those past incidents); and			
239					

240		vi. case law, state and federal laws and regulations, and Board Policies
241		prohibiting harassment and discrimination.
242		
243	d.	To determine the severity of the harassment or discrimination, factors such as
244		the following may be considered:
245		
246		i. how the misconduct affected an employee's work;
247		
248		ii. the type, frequency, and duration of the misconduct;
249		
250		iii. the number of persons involved;
251		<del></del>
252		iv. the subject(s) of harassment or discrimination;
253		
254		v. the place and situation where the incident occurred; and
255		
256		vi. other incidents at the site.
257		
258	e.	The recommendations for action(s) to be taken, consistent with any applicable
259		collective-bargaining agreement provisions, to resolve a complaint of
260		harassment or discrimination by an employee may include, but are not limited
261		to, the following:
262		
263		i. no action, if the complaint is unsubstantiated;
264		
265		ii. training requirements for the accused/employee;
266		
267		iii. oral reprimand of the accused/employee;
268		
269		iv. written reprimand of the accused/employee;
270		
271		v. suspension of the accused/employee; or
272		
273		vi. termination of the accused/employee.
274		
275	f.	Level Two: Appeal to the Chief Operating Officer/Designee If the
276		complainant or accused/employee wishes to appeal the action taken in
277		resolution of the complaint, such appeal shall be filed in accordance either with
- · ·		The state of the s

278		this Policy or relevant collective bargaining agreement, as applicable. For
279		those employees not in a bargaining unit, the appeal shall be filed in
280		accordance with the following procedures:
281		
282		i. If the grievant or accused/employee desires to appeal the EEO
283		Coordinator's decision, it may be appealed in writing to the Chief
284		Operating Officer/designee within ten (10) work days after receipt of the
285		decision.
286		
287		ii. If the Chief Operating Officer is directly involved with a complaint or with
288		the parties to the complaint complainant or accused/employee, then the
289		Chief Academic Officer shall be asked to review the matter.
290		
291		iii. Notice of the appeal shall be given to the opposite party within two (2)
292		work days of receipt of appeal.
293		
294		iv. The Chief Operating Officer/designee shall review the written complaint,
295		the accused/employee's response to the complaint, and all
296		documentation pertaining to the alleged sexual harassment or
297		discrimination, including the EEO Coordinator's decision.
298		alcontinuation, modaling the EEO Cool and action of
299		v. The Chief Operating Officer/designee, in his/her discretion, may request
300		additional information. The Chief Operating Officer/designee shall issue a
301		written decision to the parties within twenty (20) calendar days of request
302		of the appeal.
303		or the appeal.
304	<u>a.</u>	Level Three: Appeal to the Superintendent Within ten (10) work days
305	<u>y.                                    </u>	after the Chief Operating Officer/designee issues a written decision, if a party
306		is not satisfied with the decision (or if no decision has been issued within ten
307		(10) work days of the meeting), the party may appeal the decision in writing to
308		the Superintendent. If the grievance is not forwarded to the Superintendent
309		within the designated time, the grievance is considered withdrawn from the
310		grievance process and shall be so noted in the grievance file.
310		glievarice process and shall be so noted in the glievarice lile.
311		i. Notice of the appeal shall be given to the opposite party within two (2)
312		work days of receipt of appeal.
<b>-</b>		
313		ii. The Superintendent/designee shall appoint an ad hoc grievance review
314		committee as specified in Section (3)(d)(ii), above.

315			A. In an effort to resolve the grievance, within ten (10) work days after
316			the committee is designated, the committee shall meet with the
317			appealing party and, if deemed appropriate, may also meet with the
318			opposite party. Other persons may be presented as witnesses at the
319			meeting by either the appealing party or the opposite party.
320			B. The committee shall issue a written recommendation within ten (10
321			work days after the meeting, determining whether any violation has
322			occurred, and if so, recommending an appropriate remedy. A copy
323			of the recommendation shall be provided to both parties, the
324			grievant's supervisor and the Director of Labor Relations (if
325			appropriate), and the Superintendent.
326			iii. The Superintendent/designee shall review the recommendation of the
327			grievance review committee and the record of the grievance. If the
328			Superintendent/designee finds that a meeting with the grievant and/or
329			accused/employee would assist in the final determination, the
330			Superintendent/ designee may recommend scheduling a meeting for the
331			purposes of this review. The Superintendent/designee's decision is the
332			final and binding decision of the District.
333		<u>h.</u>	If the complainant is not satisfied with the results of the procedures contained
334			in this Section, he/or she may utilize other means for resolution as provided by
335			law, including seeking recourse through the federal Office for Civil Rights
336			("OCR") or Equal Employment Opportunity Commission ("EEOC").
337	5.	Rig	hts of Employees (Including Applicants as Defined in Section (2)(e))
338		a.	During any of the grievance levels, the employee (including an applicant as
339			defined in Section (2)(e)) may be represented by a person of the
340			employee's/applicant's choice once the grievance is filed with the supervisor.
341			Department of Employee Labor relations For grievances governed by Section
342			(3) that are filed by employees/applicants who choose to be represented by
343			legal counsel, the process will begin at the chief officer phase of Level 3 under
344			Section (3)(c).
345		b.	No retaliation or reprisals of any kind shall be taken by any member of the
346			administration or other employee against the employee, representative, or any
347			other participant in the grievance procedure by reason of such participation

348	6.	<u>Ger</u>	neral Provisions
349 350 351 352		a.	Grievance report forms for filing a grievance shall be available in the Department of Employee Labor Relations. Employees are to be notified of the procedures in this Policy through the Policy's distribution to schools and departments and its posting on the School Board Policies web site.
353 354 355		b.	Failure of the employee/ <u>applicant</u> to advance the grievance through the procedure within the time lines designated will result in immediate dismissal of the grievance.
356 357 358 359 360 361 362 363		C.	All records pertaining to a grievance shall may be filed in a separate grievance file and will may not be kept in the official "personnel file" of the employee/applicant, but this grievance file will be treated as provided by Fla. Stat. §§ 119.07 and 231.291(4). All decisions of management are to be forwarded to the labor relations department, which is designated as the custodian of those records for grievances involving a bargaining unit member. However, said The grievance file is subject to disclosure pursuant to the Public Records law and Fla. Stat. § 231.291(4).
364 365 366		d.	If a grievance is filed under the grievance procedure in a collective bargaining agreement, the employee may not pursue a <u>the</u> grievance under this procedure.
367 368 369 370		e.	The grievant is precluded from processing a grievance when the subject of the grievance and/or the relief requested has been, or currently is, the subject of another administrative action or appeal before $\underline{a}$ governmental body or agency or $\underline{a}$ court proceeding.
371 372		<u>f.</u>	The filing of a grievance shall not interfere with the right of the School Board to carry out its responsibilities, subject to the final decision on a grievance.
373	<u>7.                                    </u>	Sup	perintendent, Chief Counsel, and District Auditor
374 375 376 377		<u>a.</u>	When the Grievant is a Direct Board Report Employees who report directly to the Board (Superintendent, Chief Counsel, and District Auditor) shall file any grievance in writing with the Board Chair. The Chair should request appropriate District personnel to begin the investigation/ resolution

process set forth in Section (3) or (4) above, as applicable.

378

379	b.	When the Grievant is an Employee in the Office of a Direct Board
380		Report Employees of the Office of Superintendent, Office of District Auditor,
381		and Office of Chief Counsel should file any initial grievance with their direct
382		supervisor (or the EEO Coordinator, if the allegation is based on harassment
383		or discrimination) pursuant to Section (3) or (4) above (unless the grievance is
384		against a direct Board report, in which case subsection (c) below shall apply).
385		If the grievance is not resolved at this level, the grievance may be appealed as
386		set forth under Section (3) or (4), as applicable.
387	<u>C.</u>	When the Accused is a Direct Board Report When a direct Board report
388		(the Superintendent, Chief Counsel, or District Auditor) is the accused, the
389		grievant shall file the complaint in writing with the Board Chair, who shall take
390		prompt action as specified below:
391		i. First, the Chair shall notify the accused of the complaint.
392		ii. Second, the Chair shall notify the Board of the complaint. The Board
393		shall determine if the complaint appears to merit formal investigation.
394		iii. If the Board deems the complaint to merit formal investigation, the Board
395		shall set the parameters for the investigation. The investigation should
396		seek the accused/employee's response as well as the statements of the
397		grievant and witnesses.
398		iv. If a preliminary investigation is begun, the written complaint and
399		documents relating to the investigation are confidential, pursuant to Fla.
400		Stat. §§ 119.07(3)(p) & (u), 231.291(3)(a)1, and 231.262(1)(a), until the
401		investigation is either concluded or ceases to be active.
402		v. To conduct the investigation, the Board may consider:
403		A. retaining outside special counsel (which should be an attorney or law
404		firm that is not currently retained by the Board and has not handled
405		any matters for or against the Board within the past five years):
406		B. requesting the personnel-investigation department of another Florida
407		school district to conduct the inquiry:
408		C. contracting with the DOE Office of Inspector General; or

409		D. if applicable, r	referring the matter to the State Attorney's Office, the
410		Commission of	on Ethics, or other applicable state agency.
411	<u>vi.</u>	The Board and the	e employee should receive the final investigative report
412		at the same time.	
413	<u>vii.</u>		e report, the Board shall determine whether any action
414		is required. The a	ccused/employee and/or the employee's representative
415		shall have a right t	<u>o address the Board at the meeting where the decision</u>
416		will be made.	
417	<u>viii.</u>		e employment contract, if informal action such as a
418		· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	<u>led necessary, such action may be reflected in the</u>
419			tion and personnel file. In accordance with the
420		employment contra	act, if formal action such as demotion, suspension, or
421		termination is deer	<u>med necessary, the employee shall receive appropriate</u>
422		notice and opportu	inity for a hearing under Fla. Stat. §§ 120.569 and
423		120.57; and the Bo	pard's final action may be reviewed judicially pursuant
424		to Fla. Stat. § 120.	<u>68.</u>
425			
126	CTATUTODY	' AUTHORITY:	\$\$ 220 22/2\: 220 22/47\/22\: 220 2200E/44\
426	STATUTORY	AUTHORITT.	§§ 230.22(2); 230.23( <del>17</del> )( <u>22)</u> ; 230.23005( <u>11).</u>
427			<u>231.001</u> , Fla. Stat.
428	LAWS IMPLE	EMENTED:	§§ <u>119.07(3)(p) &amp; (u); 228.2001</u> ; 230.22(1); 231.001,
429			<u>231.291;</u> <u>231.262(1),</u> Fla. Stat.
430	HISTORY:		3/11/87; 9/22/99; <u>/ /02</u>

5-D Board Report September 9, 2002 Page 15 of 15

Legal Signoff:	
The Legal Department has reviewed the proposed revisions to Policy 3.31 and finds them legally sufficient for development by the Board.	
Attorney	 Date